

Title

The *Mato Tipila* Question: A Critical Examination of Sacred Places on Public Land

Grade Level

University Level (1st-2nd year)

Theme

Literature, History, Culture

Duration

Six weeks (18 classes for M/W/F courses or 12 classes for T/TH courses)

Two-three weeks reading and course work and two-three weeks essay work

Goal

Students will study and define the history of the *Oceti Sakowin* (Seven Council Fires), focusing on Lakota culture, history, and ceremonies in relationship to *Mato Tipila* (Bears Lodge/Devils Tower). Students will critically examine the points of contention regarding the use of sacred sites on public land by evaluating the uses of “Devils Tower National Monument” for recreation, rock climbing, and tourist activities. Students will explore the freedom of religious expression as it relates to Lakota culture in the context of sacred places on public lands, specifically national park lands.

The goals and objectives of this lesson critically examine the uses of *Mato Tipila*; however, these goals and objectives may be altered to examine other sacred sites on public land. Examples include, but are not limited to: *He Sapa* (The Black Hills), *Hopitutskwa* (Hopi Land), *Tsimontukwi* (Woodruff Butte), *Bulyum Puyuik* (Mount Shasta), Mt. Quilish (Peru).

Objectives

- Students will be able to list the seven nations of the *Oceti Sakowin*.
- Students will be able to list the seven Lakota nations.
- Students will be able identify Lakota accounts of *Mato Tipila*.
- Students will be able identify Lakota ceremonies associated with *Mato Tipila*.
- Students will gain an understanding of the issues associated with religious expression and ceremonial rights at sacred places on public lands.
- Students will critically and objectively evaluate the complexity of the “*Mato Tipila* Question” and the related issue of uses of sacred places on public lands, expressing these evaluations with a succinct argument within a research essay.

South Dakota Standards

This assignment partially fulfills the following Goals of the South Dakota System General Education Requirements:

GOAL 1: *Students will write effectively and responsibly and will understand and interpret the written expression of others.*

Student Learning Outcomes:

As a result of taking courses meeting this goal, students will:

Learning Outcomes:	Assessment
1. Write using standard American English, including correct punctuation, grammar, and	Research paper, 6-8 pp. Preliminary assignments and response papers

sentence structure	
2. Write logically	Research paper, 6-8 pp. Preliminary assignments and response papers
3. Write persuasively, with a variety of rhetorical strategies (e.g., expository, argumentative, descriptive)	Research paper, 6-8 pp. Preliminary assignments and response papers
4. Incorporate formal research and documentation into their writing, including research obtained through modern, technology-based research tools	Research paper, 6-8 pp.

GOAL 7: *Students will recognize when information is needed and have the ability to locate, organize, critically evaluate, and effectively use information from a variety of sources with intellectual integrity.*

Student Learning Outcomes:

As a result of taking courses meeting this goal, students will:

Learning Outcomes:	Assessment
1. Determine the extent of information needed	Research paper, 6-8 pp.
2. Access the needed information effectively and efficiently	Research paper, 6-8 pp.
3. Evaluate information and its sources critically	Research paper, 6-8 pp.
4. Use information effectively to accomplish a specific purpose	Research paper, 6-8 pp.
5. Use information in an ethical and legal manner	Research paper, 6-8 pp.

Cultural Concept

For the *Ocececi Sakowin*, and specifically the Lakota Nation, *Mato Tipila* and other sacred places in and around *He Sapa* are central to Lakota historical and cultural beliefs. The history of how Lakotas came upon the world, the story of the great race, and the Lakota Sundance ceremony are all intimately connected with *Mato Tipilia* as a sacred place. Devils Tower as a national park is linked with tourism, rock climbing and other recreational activities, and other religious ceremonies. Can public lands be used for ceremonial sites? Can there be reconciliation between the two sides of the argument? Can the Devils Tower National Monument be used for both sacred Lakota ceremonies and recreational activities? Students, having gained knowledge of both Lakota culture and ceremonies and recreational activities, will argue, in an essay, their viewpoint of the issue.

Cultural Background

- Oceceti Sakowin – Seven Council Fires

Dakota

1. Mdewakantonwan Spirit Lake Village
2. Wahpekutetonwan Leaf Shooters Village
3. Wahpetonwan Camping among Leaves
4. Sisitonwan Fish Scales Villages

Nakota

5. Ihanktonwan Camping at the End
6. Ihanktonwanna Camping at the Little End

Lakota

7. Titonwan Camping on the Plains

Lakota Oyates

1. Sicangu Thighs-scorched Brules
2. Oohenonpa Boiled Twice Two Kettles
3. Minikanyewozupi Plant –near-water Minikanzus
4. Oglala Cast-on-own Oglala
5. Itazipco No-bow Sans Arc
6. Sihasapa Black-foot Blackfeet
7. Hunkpapa End-of-horn Hunkpapa

- N. Black Elk in “The Great Race and the Origin of the Bow and Arrow”: “[The Thunder-being] further told [Red Thunder] that the place where they had the race was the heart of the earth. He said, ‘Someday your tribe [Oceceti Sakowin] will be in this land.’ It was promised the land...at the present time we [Lakotas] found it and it is the Black Hills” (310).
- James LaPointe in “Devils Tower”: “Devils Tower was a hallowed spire beckoning the native peoples to perform their religious rituals around its base” (65).
- James LaPointe in “The SunDance and Devil’s Tower”: “Devils Tower has other legends. Those Lakota tribes that traveled the northern plains called the sharp mound *Wipayang Wachipi Paho* (sundance mounds), because a young man once descended from the Tower, bearing a message from Taku Wakan, commanding the Lakota to perform a prayer dance called: *Wipayang Wachi* (gaze at the sun while dancing)” (68).
- Chief White Bull in “Sioux: More about Bears Tipi”: “‘Bears Tipi’ was considered part of the Black Hills and belonged to the Minneconjui, Hunkpapas and Itazipco. We did not worship this butte, but worshiped our God. We had our own worship called the ‘SunDance.’ ‘Bears Tipi’ is well known to all Sioux Indians and it was an important place to them” (25).

- Devils Tower National Park is currently shared by American Indians, tourists, and recreationalists, including rock climbers. The Lakota see these actions as an affront and desecration of a sacred place.

Student Activities

- Students should watch the *Mato Tipila* portion of *In the Light of Reverence: Protecting America's Sacred Lands* and have small group discussions on the varying points of view regarding the uses of sacred places.
- Students should learn about the seven nations of the *Oceti Sakowin* and the seven Lakota nations.
- Students should read critical articles from numerous Native and non-Native sources listed in the reference section; these articles should be chosen by instructor to correspond to assigned primary readings.
- Students should discuss texts in class using a large group “talking circle,” small group discussions, and teacher instructed lectures.
- Lakota community members may be asked to deliver lectures during one or more classes; lectures should concern the sacred uses of *Mato Tipila*.
- Students should write response papers (300-600 words) for each reading assignment.
- Students should do individual library research incorporating varying sources; i.e. articles from scholarly journals, articles from scholarly books, or scholarly books.
- Students should write a research essay of at least 1800 words (see Assignment Sheet).

Resources

Writing utensils, paper, notebook, computer access, internet access, copy of DVD, copies of articles and/or copies of excerpts from texts and/or articles

Assessment

Because class participation is essential to this assignment students will be graded on how well they contribute to class discussions. This grade will reflect not only the degree of participation, but also the quality of contributions. Students will be expected to be involved in every class. Active and engaged in-class participation in writing exercises, class discussions, and workshops is expected. The quality of this class is directly related to the quality of discussions, so students should take responsibility by asking questions, offering ideas, and responding to their peers. Additionally, each student should come to class prepared; having completed assignments, having read assigned materials carefully, making notes, forming thoughtful responses, and they should be prepared to discuss each assignment in class.

Brief response papers will be assigned for each reading. Assignment details should be announced prior to due dates and will be collected at the beginning of the class in which they are due. Each paper must be typed, double-spaced, in 12-point Times New Roman font, and follow standard MLA format. Each paper should be 300-600 words in length.

The final essay assignment must adhere to MLA format. For specific guidelines for the essay assignment see ASSIGNMENT SHEET. Essays should be graded using the following grading rubric:

A: Writing that demonstrates unusual competence. Thesis statement is clear and specific. Content is both unified and coherent. Evidence from primary text and secondary scholarly source material is abundant and directly develops thesis statement, which supports a cogent, persuasive argument. Grammatical/mechanical or documentation errors are minimal, with no patterns of

serious error. Sentence patterns are varied. MLA style documentation of secondary source material is accurate. Diction is tight, fresh, and appropriate to audience and purpose. The “A” essay is imaginative. The writing is thoughtful and avoids the obvious. “A” writing offers analysis rather than summary, interpretation of literary elements rather than description

B: Writing that demonstrates competence. Thesis statement is clear and specific. Content is organized and generally coherent. Key ideas are supported with details from primary text and secondary scholarly source material. Essay may contain grammatical/mechanical and documentation errors, but those errors do not detract from the essay’s content. Sentence patterns are generally varied but may show some repetition. MLA style documentation is sufficient with few errors. Diction is generally concise, accurate, and appropriate to audience and purpose. The “B” essay offers substantial information with few distractions. “B” writing offers some analytical interpretation of a literary text, combined with summary and description.

C: Writing that suggests competence, but with a tendency to depend upon the self-evident and the cliché. Thesis statement is non-specific. Content may be ineffectively organized, with weak or missing transitions. Grammatical/mechanical errors may be repeated or frequent. Development is thin: Generalizations are not developed with appropriate details; source material may be used inaccurately. MLA style documentation contains errors but may still be judged as sufficient for freshman writing. Diction is limited in range, occasionally marred by repetition, redundancy, imprecision. Sentences may be choppy, monotonous. The “C” essay lacks both imagination and an awareness of choices that effect style. “C” writing offers light analysis and interpretation. Summary and description of literary texts predominate in “C” papers.

D: Writing that suggests incompetence. Thesis statement may be unclear or missing. Content is disorganized. Essay fails to provide the reader with clear direction and focus, and transitions between ideas are missing. Ideas are left undeveloped. Generalizations are not supported, with source material frequently used inaccurately.. Grammatical or sentence structure errors may distort the intended meaning. Mechanical errors or problems with MLA style documentation are prevalent. Diction is limited in range and may be inappropriate. Evidence of proofreading is scanty. The “D” essay often gives the impression of having been conceived and written in haste. “D” writing for offers summary and description; Interpretation and analysis are weak or missing.

F: Writing that demonstrates incompetence. Essay lacks thesis statements, unity. Writing is marginally coherent. Few ideas are developed or supported, and inaccuracies are common. Serious errors in MLA style documentation are frequent, or documentation is missing. Grammar, spelling, and sentence structure are weak. In short, the ideas, organization and style fall far below what is acceptable in college writing. “F” writing is characterized by summary and description only.

References

- Black Elk, N. “The Great Race and the Origin of the Bow and Arrow.” *The Sixth Grandfather: Black Elk’s Teaching Given to John G. Neihardt* (pp. 309-310). Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.
- Badlands and Lake Association. (2009). *Black Hills & Badlands*. Retrieved online at <<http://www.blackhillsbadlands.com>> on June 19, 2009.
- Deloria, V, Jr. (1999). Reflections and revelation: Knowing land, places and ourselves. *For this land: Writings on religion in America* (pp. 250-60). New York: Routledge.

- National Park Service. (2009). Devil's Tower National Monument. Retrieved online at <<http://www.nps.gov/deto/index.htm/>> on June 19, 2009.
- Dussias, A.M. (2001). Cultural conflicts regarding land use: The conflict between recreational users at Devils Tower and Native American ceremonial users. *Vermont Journal of Environmental Law*. 2 (pp. 13-40).
- Dustin, D. and Schneider, I. (2001). Collaborative conflict resolution at Devil's Tower National Monument. *Parks and Recreation* 36.7 (pp. 80-86).
- McAvoy, L.H. and Frakt, A.N. (2002). Cross-cultural claims on Devils Tower National Monument: A case study. *Leisure Sciences* 24.1 (pp. 79-88).
- Freedman, E. (2007). Protecting sacred sites on public land: Religion and alliances in the *Mato Tipila*- Devils Tower litigation. *American Indian Quarterly* 31.1 (pp. 1-22).
- Hamilton, C. (1996) "One man's rock is another's holy site. *Christian Science Monitor* 88.138 (pp. 4-5).
- Hanson, J.R. and Chirinos, S. (1997). *Ethnographic overview and assessment of Devils Tower National Monument, Wyoming*. U.S. Department of the Interior. Denver: National Park Service.
- In the Light of Reverence: Protecting America's Sacred Lands*. (2002). Produced and directed by Christopher McLeod. DVD. Bullfrog Films.
- LaPointe, J. (1976). Devils Tower. *Legends of the Lakota* (pp. 65-67). San Francisco: Indian Historian Press.
- LaPointe, J. (1976). Milky Way and Fallen Star. *Legends of the Lakota* (pp. 29-34). San Francisco: Indian Historian Press.
- LaPointe, J. (1976). The Sun Dance and Devil's Tower. *Legends of the Lakota* (pp. 68-70). San Francisco: Indian Historian Press.
- Grafe, E. and Horstead, P. (1874). Map of a reconnaissance of the Black Hills: July and August, 1874. *Exploring with Custer The 1874 Black hills Expedition* (p. 201). Custer, SD: Golden Valley Press.
- McLeod, C. (2009). *Sacred Land Film Project*. Earth Island Institute. Retrieved from <<http://www.sacredland.org>> on June 19, 2009.
- One Bull. (1982). Sioux legend: About Bears Tipi. *First encounters: Indian legends of Devils Tower* (p. 23). D. Stone. Wyoming: Shirl.
- Pendley, W.P. (1997). National Park Service shuts down Devils Tower. *Human events* 53.23 (p.11).
- Walker, J.R. (1917). How the Lakota came upon the world. *The Sun Dance and other ceremonies of the Oglala division of the Teton Dakota*. Anthropological Papers of the American Museum of Natural History (pp. 181-82). 16.2 New York: American Museum of Natural History.
- White Bull. (1982). Sioux: more about Bears Tipi. *First encounters: Indian legends of Devils Tower* (p. 25). D. Stone. Wyoming: Shirl.

Yablon, M. (2004). Property rights and sacred sites: Federal regulatory responses to American Indian religious claims on public land." *The Yale Law Journal* 113.7 (pp. 1623-62).

Developer

Brian J. Twenter
btwenter@usd.edu

Date

19 June 2009

Purpose

We have investigated how the *Oceti Sakowin*, and specifically the Lakota Nation, regard *Mato Tipila* and other sacred places in and around *He Sapa* as central to Lakota historical and cultural beliefs. The goal was to explicate how the history of how Lakotas came upon the world, the story of the great race, and the Lakota Sundance ceremony are all intimately connected with *Mato Tipilia* as a sacred place. We also examined how Devils Tower as a national park is linked with tourism, rock climbing and other recreational activities, and other religious ceremonies. We explored texts from several genres and considered if public lands can be used for ceremonial sites. Through our exploration, we have a greater understanding of the two sides of the argument. For your research essay you must produce an interesting and detailed analysis questioning if the Devils Tower National Monument can be used for both sacred Lakota ceremonies and recreational activities. You should pose an interesting, problematic, or significant question about the “*Mato Tipila* question” and use textual evidence and secondary sources to support your analysis. You may approach this essay from various directions, but you are required to conference with me before you begin your essay.

Assignment

Research. Write an essay analyzing the “*Mato Tipila* question.” First, you should find *three to five* scholarly sources that analyze the issues in several *different* ways.

The Essay. In your essay, you will analyze the arguments of at least *three* scholars. Then you have three options for your essay:

1. Summarize the arguments of the scholars and use your own informed analysis of the issues to demonstrate which scholars’ analysis is correct, and why s/he is correct.
2. Summarize the arguments of the scholars and, if you feel that they have not correctly analyzed the issues, demonstrate your own correct analysis.
3. Or, summarize the scholarly sources, combine all of the scholars’ theses into one coherent idea, and demonstrate how combining these critics’ ideas create a better analysis of the issues.

Regardless of which direction you chose, you must quote directly from your scholarly sources and from other primary texts to support your argument.

Audience

Your targeted audience is your instructor and peers, who have read the texts you are writing about; nonetheless, you should provide *some* context for your analysis somewhere in the introduction of your essay. Context includes a brief history of Lakota culture, religious, and ceremonial practices and a discussion of what other scholars have said about the issues.

Format

MLA formatting and documentation. You must include a works cited page for this essay.

Length

Your essay must be **at least 1800** words (excluding the heading and the title of your work and your works cited page)

Research Requirements

- You must use between *three and five academic sources* (articles from scholarly journals, articles from scholarly books, or scholarly books) and the film *In the Light of Reverence: Protecting America's Sacred Lands*. You will have to use *a minimum of four sources* for this essay.
- Your sources cannot come from the internet; all of your sources must come from the library and databases or Inter Library Loans.

General Reminders

- You must schedule a conference and meet with me outside of class about your essay.
- If you are having difficulties finding materials as you research, speak with me or a reference librarian *well in advance of your conference*. During our conference is not an appropriate time to voice these complaints.

Conferences

Think of the conferences as preemptive feedback. Before you even start writing your first draft, you will have a chance to ask me questions about the direction you wish to take with your essay. During the conference, we will discuss the research you have done. We will review the articles, and I will be happy to clarify anything that is confusing in the articles. We will also discuss the direction you are planning to take with your essay, and I will also help you fit the scholarly ideas into your essay.

Please note, though, you will dictate the topics for discussion during the conference. To be prepared, then, you will bring the articles that you have found in your initial research. You will have *read* these articles and will be able to *discuss* those articles in the conference. **Do not use this time as research troubleshooting.** If you come to the conference unprepared (without at minimum three articles and some sort of argument outline), you will not receive credit for the conference.

Bring to the conference:

- Your preliminary research.
- Any outline work you have already done with the text.
- Provisional Thesis Statement.
- Works Cited page.
- A possible list of questions you would like me to address.

Due Dates

- Topic Proposal: **Due Date**.
- Conference: _____ (**Conference Dates**).
- In Class Peer Review: **Peer Review Day**.
- Final Draft with Works Cited: **Final Due Date**.

Additional Guidelines for the Research Essay

- Develop a clear, focused thesis that explicitly indicates your proposed analysis of the issues.
- Use substantial textual evidence and secondary sources to support your analysis.
- Always be sure to “unpack” your quotations. All quotes must be properly introduced. All quotes and passages used as support must be adequately developed and explained. A quote cannot stand alone in the essay. No “sandwiched quotes.”
- Do not use first person (I, we, our, me). When it comes to a personal interpretation of literature, you are the authority; however, phrases that begin with “I believe” and “I think” detract from your authority and familiarity with the novel and make your interpretation look like simple personal opinion rather than informed analysis.
- Use “literary present” tense when discussing literature and distinguish between the *author* or *poet* and the *narrator* or *persona*.
- A works cited page must accompany this essay; include a bibliographic citation on the works cited page for the text and each secondary source you analyze.
- Late research essays **will not be accepted** except under *extraordinary* circumstances, and then only if you have made every effort to contact me ahead of time.